

# Lecture 9: Axiomatic Set Theory

December 16, 2014

# Today

Key points of today's lecture:

Key points of today's lecture:

- ▶ The iterative concept of set.

Key points of today's lecture:

- ▶ The iterative concept of set.
- ▶ The language of set theory (LOST).

Key points of today's lecture:

- ▶ The iterative concept of set.
- ▶ The language of set theory (LOST).
- ▶ The axioms of Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory (ZFC).

Key points of today's lecture:

- ▶ The iterative concept of set.
- ▶ The language of set theory (LOST).
- ▶ The axioms of Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory (ZFC).
- ▶ Justification of the axioms based on the iterative concept of set.

# The language of set theory, I



# The language of set theory, I

The language of set theory (LOST) consists of the logical symbols and  $=$ , and a *single* binary relation symbol,  $\in$ , called *membership*.

# The language of set theory, I

The language of set theory (LOST) consists of the logical symbols and  $=$ , and a *single* binary relation symbol,  $\in$ , called *membership*.

Note that the atomic formulas of LOST are of the form

# The language of set theory, I

The language of set theory (LOST) consists of the logical symbols and  $=$ , and a *single* binary relation symbol,  $\in$ , called *membership*.

Note that the atomic formulas of LOST are of the form

$$x = y \text{ and } x \in y.$$

# The language of set theory, I

The language of set theory (LOST) consists of the logical symbols and  $=$ , and a *single* binary relation symbol,  $\in$ , called *membership*.

Note that the atomic formulas of LOST are of the form

$$x = y \text{ and } x \in y.$$

We will write

# The language of set theory, I

The language of set theory (LOST) consists of the logical symbols and  $=$ , and a *single* binary relation symbol,  $\in$ , called *membership*.

Note that the atomic formulas of LOST are of the form

$$x = y \text{ and } x \in y.$$

We will write

$$x \neq y \text{ and } x \notin y$$

# The language of set theory, I

The language of set theory (LOST) consists of the logical symbols and  $=$ , and a *single* binary relation symbol,  $\in$ , called *membership*.

Note that the atomic formulas of LOST are of the form

$$x = y \text{ and } x \in y.$$

We will write

$$x \neq y \text{ and } x \notin y$$

for the negation of  $x = y$  and  $x \in y$ , respectively.

# The language of set theory, II

# The language of set theory, II

In addition to the variables of our formal language,  $v_1, v_2, \dots$ , we will also use the letters



# The language of set theory, II

In addition to the variables of our formal language,  $v_1, v_2, \dots$ , we will also use the letters

$$x, y, z, u, w, x_1, x_2, \dots, y_1, y_2, \dots, w_1, w_2, \dots$$

# The language of set theory, II

In addition to the variables of our formal language,  $v_1, v_2, \dots$ , we will also use the letters

$$x, y, z, u, w, x_1, x_2, \dots, y_1, y_2, \dots, w_1, w_2, \dots$$

to stand for arbitrary formal variables.

# The language of set theory, II

In addition to the variables of our formal language,  $v_1, v_2, \dots$ , we will also use the letters

$$x, y, z, u, w, x_1, x_2, \dots, y_1, y_2, \dots, w_1, w_2, \dots$$

to stand for arbitrary formal variables.

We will allow ourselves to use the standard abbreviations:  $\vee, \wedge, \leftrightarrow$  and  $\exists$  for “or”, “and”, “if and only if”, and “there exists”.

# Axioms 0 and 1

## 0. Axiom of Set Existence:

## 0. Axiom of Set Existence:

$$\exists v_1 v_1 = v_1.$$

## 0. Axiom of Set Existence:

$$\exists v_1 v_1 = v_1.$$

(There is a set.)

## 0. Axiom of Set Existence:

$$\exists v_1 v_1 = v_1.$$

(There is a set.)

## 1. Axiom of Extensionality:



## 0. Axiom of Set Existence:

$$\exists v_1 v_1 = v_1.$$

(There is a set.)

## 1. Axiom of Extensionality:

$$\forall v_1 \forall v_2 (\forall v_3 (v_3 \in v_1 \leftrightarrow v_3 \in v_2) \rightarrow v_1 = v_2).$$

## 0. Axiom of Set Existence:

$$\exists v_1 v_1 = v_1.$$

(There is a set.)

## 1. Axiom of Extensionality:

$$\forall v_1 \forall v_2 (\forall v_3 (v_3 \in v_1 \leftrightarrow v_3 \in v_2) \rightarrow v_1 = v_2).$$

(Sets that have the same members are identical.)

# Axiom 2

## 2. Axiom of Foundation:

## 2. Axiom of Foundation:

$$\forall v_1 (\exists v_2 v_2 \in v_1 \rightarrow \exists v_2 (v_2 \in v_1 \wedge \forall v_3 v_3 \notin v_1 \vee v_3 \notin v_2)).$$

## 2. Axiom of Foundation:

$$\forall v_1 (\exists v_2 v_2 \in v_1 \rightarrow \exists v_2 (v_2 \in v_1 \wedge \forall v_3 v_3 \notin v_1 \vee v_3 \notin v_2)).$$

(Every non-empty set has a member which has no members in common with it.)

# Axiom 3

**3. Axiom Schema of Comprehension:** For each LOST formula  $\varphi(x, z, w_1, \dots, w_n)$  with the (distinct) free variables among those shown, the following is an axiom:



**3. Axiom Schema of Comprehension:** For each LOST formula  $\varphi(x, z, w_1, \dots, w_n)$  with the (distinct) free variables among those shown, the following is an axiom:

$$\forall w_1 \cdots \forall w_n \forall z \exists y \forall x (x \in y \leftrightarrow (x \in z \wedge \varphi)).$$

**3. Axiom Schema of Comprehension:** For each LOST formula  $\varphi(x, z, w_1, \dots, w_n)$  with the (distinct) free variables among those shown, the following is an axiom:

$$\forall w_1 \cdots \forall w_n \forall z \exists y \forall x (x \in y \leftrightarrow (x \in z \wedge \varphi)).$$

(For any sets  $z$  and any property  $P$  which can be expressed by a formula of LOST, there is a set whose members are those members of  $z$  that have property  $P$ .)

**3. Axiom Schema of Comprehension:** For each LOST formula  $\varphi(x, z, w_1, \dots, w_n)$  with the (distinct) free variables among those shown, the following is an axiom:

$$\forall w_1 \cdots \forall w_n \forall z \exists y \forall x (x \in y \leftrightarrow (x \in z \wedge \varphi)).$$

(For any sets  $z$  and any property  $P$  which can be expressed by a formula of LOST, there is a set whose members are those members of  $z$  that have property  $P$ .)

!

# Axioms 4 and 5

## 4. Axiom of Pairing:

## 4. Axiom of Pairing:

$$\forall v_1 \forall v_2 \exists v_3 (v_1 \in v_3 \wedge v_2 \in v_3).$$

## 4. Axiom of Pairing:

$$\forall v_1 \forall v_2 \exists v_3 (v_1 \in v_3 \wedge v_2 \in v_3).$$

(For any two sets, there is a set to which they both belong, i.e., of which they are both members.)

## 4. Axiom of Pairing:

$$\forall v_1 \forall v_2 \exists v_3 (v_1 \in v_3 \wedge v_2 \in v_3).$$

(For any two sets, there is a set to which they both belong, i.e., of which they are both members.)

## 5. Axiom of Union:



## 4. Axiom of Pairing:

$$\forall v_1 \forall v_2 \exists v_3 (v_1 \in v_3 \wedge v_2 \in v_3).$$

(For any two sets, there is a set to which they both belong, i.e., of which they are both members.)

## 5. Axiom of Union:

$$\forall v_1 \exists v_2 \forall v_3 \forall v_4 ((v_4 \in v_3 \wedge v_3 \in v_1) \rightarrow v_4 \in v_2).$$

## 4. Axiom of Pairing:

$$\forall v_1 \forall v_2 \exists v_3 (v_1 \in v_3 \wedge v_2 \in v_3).$$

(For any two sets, there is a set to which they both belong, i.e., of which they are both members.)

## 5. Axiom of Union:

$$\forall v_1 \exists v_2 \forall v_3 \forall v_4 ((v_4 \in v_3 \wedge v_3 \in v_1) \rightarrow v_4 \in v_2).$$

(For any set, there is another set to which all members of members of the first set belongs.)

## 4. Axiom of Pairing:

$$\forall v_1 \forall v_2 \exists v_3 (v_1 \in v_3 \wedge v_2 \in v_3).$$

(For any two sets, there is a set to which they both belong, i.e., of which they are both members.)

## 5. Axiom of Union:

$$\forall v_1 \exists v_2 \forall v_3 \forall v_4 ((v_4 \in v_3 \wedge v_3 \in v_1) \rightarrow v_4 \in v_2).$$

(For any set, there is another set to which all members of members of the first set belongs.)

!

# Axiom 6

# Axiom 6

In the statement of the next axiom, the notation  $\exists!v_i$  is shorthand for the obvious way of expressing “there is exactly one  $v_i$ ”.

# Axiom 6

In the statement of the next axiom, the notation  $\exists!v_i$  is shorthand for the obvious way of expressing “there is exactly one  $v_i$ ”.

## 6. Axiom Schema of Replacement:

# Axiom 6

In the statement of the next axiom, the notation  $\exists!v_i$  is shorthand for the obvious way of expressing “there is exactly one  $v_i$ ”.

**6. Axiom Schema of Replacement:** For each LOST formula  $\varphi(x, y, z, w_1, \dots, w_n)$  with free variables among those shown, the following is an axiom:

In the statement of the next axiom, the notation  $\exists!v_i$  is shorthand for the obvious way of expressing “there is exactly one  $v_i$ ”.

**6. Axiom Schema of Replacement:** For each LOST formula  $\varphi(x, y, z, w_1, \dots, w_n)$  with free variables among those shown, the following is an axiom:

$$\forall w_1 \cdots \forall w_n \forall z (\forall x (x \in z \rightarrow \exists! y \varphi) \\ \rightarrow \exists u \forall x (x \in z \rightarrow \exists y (y \in u \wedge \varphi))).$$



In the statement of the next axiom, the notation  $\exists!v_i$  is shorthand for the obvious way of expressing “there is exactly one  $v_i$ ”.

**6. Axiom Schema of Replacement:** For each LOST formula  $\varphi(x, y, z, w_1, \dots, w_n)$  with free variables among those shown, the following is an axiom:

$$\forall w_1 \cdots \forall w_n \forall z (\forall x (x \in z \rightarrow \exists! y \varphi) \\ \rightarrow \exists u \forall x (x \in z \rightarrow \exists y (y \in u \wedge \varphi))).$$

(For any set  $z$  and relation  $R$  (which *must* be expressible by some first order formula  $\varphi$  of LOST), if each member  $x$  of  $z$  bears the relation  $R$  to exactly one set  $y_x$ , then there is a set to which all these  $y_x$  belong.)

# Axiom 7

# Axiom 7

For the next axiom, let  $\mathcal{S}(x) = x \cup \{x\}$ .

For the next axiom, let  $\mathcal{S}(x) = x \cup \{x\}$ .

## 7. Axiom of Infinity:

For the next axiom, let  $\mathcal{S}(x) = x \cup \{x\}$ .

## 7. Axiom of Infinity:

$$\exists v_1(\emptyset \in v_0 \wedge \forall v_1(v_1 \in v_0 \rightarrow \mathcal{S}(v_1) \in v_0)).$$

For the next axiom, let  $\mathcal{S}(x) = x \cup \{x\}$ .

## 7. Axiom of Infinity:

$$\exists v_1(\emptyset \in v_1 \wedge \forall v_1(v_1 \in v_0 \rightarrow \mathcal{S}(v_1) \in v_0)).$$

(There is a set that has the empty set as a member and is closed under the operation  $\mathcal{S}$ .)

# Axiom 8

# Axiom 8

For the next axiom, let “ $v_3 \subseteq v_1$ ” abbreviate  
“ $\forall v_4 (v_4 \in v_3 \rightarrow v_4 \in v_1)$ ”.



For the next axiom, let “ $v_3 \subseteq v_1$ ” abbreviate  
“ $\forall v_4 (v_4 \in v_3 \rightarrow v_4 \in v_1)$ ”.

## 8. Axiom of Power Set:

For the next axiom, let “ $v_3 \subseteq v_1$ ” abbreviate  
“ $\forall v_4 (v_4 \in v_3 \rightarrow v_4 \in v_1)$ ”.

## 8. Axiom of Power Set:

$$\forall v_1 \exists v_2 \forall v_3 (v_3 \subseteq v_1 \rightarrow v_3 \in v_2).$$

For the next axiom, let “ $v_3 \subseteq v_1$ ” abbreviate  
“ $\forall v_4 (v_4 \in v_3 \rightarrow v_4 \in v_1)$ ”.

## 8. Axiom of Power Set:

$$\forall v_1 \exists v_2 \forall v_3 (v_3 \subseteq v_1 \rightarrow v_3 \in v_2).$$

(For any set, there is a set to which all subsets of that set belong.)

# Axiom 9

## 9. Axiom of Choice:

## 9. Axiom of Choice:

$$\begin{aligned} \forall v_1 (\forall v_2 \forall v_3 ((v_2 \in v_1 \wedge v_3 \in v_1) \\ \rightarrow (v_2 \neq \emptyset \wedge (v_2 = v_3 \vee v_2 \cap v_3 = \emptyset))) \\ \rightarrow \exists v_4 \forall v_5 (v_5 \in v_1 \rightarrow \exists! v_6 v_6 \in v_4 \cap v_5)) \end{aligned}$$

**9. Axiom of Choice:**

$$\begin{aligned} \forall v_1 (\forall v_2 \forall v_3 ((v_2 \in v_1 \wedge v_3 \in v_1) \\ \rightarrow (v_2 \neq \emptyset \wedge (v_2 = v_3 \vee v_2 \cap v_3 = \emptyset))) \\ \rightarrow \exists v_4 \forall v_5 (v_5 \in v_1 \rightarrow \exists! v_6 v_6 \in v_4 \cap v_5)) \end{aligned}$$

(If  $x$  is a set of pairwise disjoint non-empty sets, then there is a set that has exactly one member in common with each member of  $x$ .)

**9. Axiom of Choice:**

$$\begin{aligned}
 &\forall v_1 (\forall v_2 \forall v_3 ((v_2 \in v_1 \wedge v_3 \in v_1) \\
 &\quad \rightarrow (v_2 \neq \emptyset \wedge (v_2 = v_3 \vee v_2 \cap v_3 = \emptyset))) \\
 &\quad \rightarrow \exists v_4 \forall v_5 (v_5 \in v_1 \rightarrow \exists! v_6 v_6 \in v_4 \cap v_5))
 \end{aligned}$$

(If  $x$  is a set of pairwise disjoint non-empty sets, then there is a set that has exactly one member in common with each member of  $x$ .)

!!



Work in groups to justify

**GROUP 1: Axiom Schema of Comprehension:** For each LOST formula  $\varphi(x, z, w_1, \dots, w_n)$  with the (distinct) free variables among those shown, the following is an axiom:

$$\forall w_1 \cdots \forall w_n \forall z \exists y \forall x (x \in y \leftrightarrow (x \in z \wedge \varphi)).$$

**GROUP 2: Axiom of Union:**

$$\forall v_1 \exists v_2 \forall v_3 \forall v_4 ((v_4 \in v_3 \wedge v_3 \in v_1) \rightarrow v_4 \in v_2).$$

**GROUP 3: Axiom of Infinity:**

$$\exists v_1 (\emptyset \in v_1 \wedge \forall v_2 (v_2 \in v_1 \rightarrow \mathcal{S}(v_2) \in v_1)).$$

# Work in groups to justify

**GROUP 1: Axiom Schema of Comprehension:** For each LOST formula  $\varphi(x, z, w_1, \dots, w_n)$  with the (distinct) free variables among those shown, the following is an axiom:

$$\forall w_1 \cdots \forall w_n \forall z \exists y \forall x (x \in y \leftrightarrow (x \in z \wedge \varphi)).$$

**GROUP 2: Axiom of Union:**

$$\forall v_1 \exists v_2 \forall v_3 \forall v_4 ((v_4 \in v_3 \wedge v_3 \in v_1) \rightarrow v_4 \in v_2).$$

**GROUP 3: Axiom of Infinity:**

$$\exists v_1 (\emptyset \in v_1 \wedge \forall v_2 (v_2 \in v_1 \rightarrow \mathcal{S}(v_2) \in v_1)).$$

!!

# Group 1: Justification of Comprehension

$$\forall w_1 \cdots \forall w_n \forall z \exists y \forall x (x \in y \leftrightarrow (x \in z \wedge \varphi)).$$

## Group 2: Justification of Union

$$\forall v_1 \exists v_2 \forall v_3 \forall v_4 ((v_4 \in v_3 \wedge v_3 \in v_1) \rightarrow v_4 \in v_2).$$

## Group 3: Justification of Infinity

$$\exists v_1(\emptyset \in v_1 \wedge \forall v_2(v_2 \in v_1 \rightarrow \mathcal{S}(v_2) \in v_1)).$$